RESEARCH

RURAL & REMOTE ACCESS TO JUSTICE: APPLICATION RESEARCH



"



RURAL & REMOTE ACCESS TO JUSTICE A BOLDNESS PROJECT

Canadian Forum on Civil Justice 🍁 Forum canadien sur la justice civile

Rural & Remote Access to Justice Application Research

July 2015, Toronto, ON



Canadian Forum on Civil Justice 🍁 Forum canadien sur la justice civile

the Canadian Forum on Civil Justice for the Rural and Remote Access to Justice Boldness Project.

The Rural and Remote Access to Justice Boldness Project:

This review has been commissioned to support the work of the Rural and Remote Access to Justice Boldness Project (RRBP). The RRBP is a special initiative funded by Legal Aid Ontario (LAO) to transform legal service delivery. It is led by four community legal clinic Executive Directors and a LAO staff liaison working in rural and remote communities. The project partners are using a social innovation methodology (The Boldness Collaboratory™) to investigate and experiment with a multiplicity of ways to increase access to justice for people living on a low income in rural and remote communities of Ontario. By commissioning the review, the partners wished to identify the current trends, gaps in the research, and promising practices in service delivery. Specifically, they wished to know how "rural and remote" is understood, what is known about access to justice challenges and opportunities in rural and remote communities, whether the research to date has documented differences with urban communities, and how other provinces and countries have handled the access to justice challenges in rural and remote areas.

INTRODUCTION

This memo provides a survey of smartphone applications that might serve as useful reference points for the development of a rural access to justice app. It is hoped that such an application could help "address the rural conundrum" by using natural language, issue identification, resource listing and mapping, as well as data tracking and sharing to improve access to justice in Canada's remote communities. By sorting through the "shopping list" of suggested features and functionality provided by the Boldness Project, and by searching for similar use cases, a number of applications came forward as potential sources of inspiration.

In addition to summarizing and comparing related apps, this memo also attempts to contextualize the app development landscape in Canada. To that end, a brief overview of mobile phone technology statistics in Canada (Appendix B & C) as well comparative charts of national network coverage (Appendix A) have been included.

REVIEW OF FINDINGS

Research was conducted primarily within the Apple iTunes and Google Play online storefronts. Generally speaking, there were very few dedicated legal applications, especially compared with medical applications. Almost half of the comparable applications covered in this report are medical in nature. These apps have diagnosis, information sharing, and professional support functions that could be implemented in a rural access to justice app.

Of all the apps included in this report, the most promising research finding was not, properly speaking, an app at all. FrontlineSMS is a technology that works on all mobile phones, and is currently deployed in rural communities around the globe to gather and disseminate information. It could be used by the rural and remote project without extensive modification, and is free for organizations to download and run. FrontlineSMS has even developed a legal branch (FrontlineLegal) to adapt its technological solution to the legal market.

MOBILE PHONE TECHNOLOGY IN CANADA

In 2014, 28,412,638 Canadians subscribed to a mobile phone service plan. It is estimated that approximately 68% of those subscribers owned and operated at least one smartphone.¹ Smartphones can connect to the internet either through local wifi or on mobile data networks and are capable of handling complex computational tasks. In contrast, so called "feature phones", owned by an estimated 19% of Canadian mobile users, may or may not be capable of internet access, and do not have the computational power required to run all smartphone applications.² There are two dominant smartphone operating systems in the market today: Apple's iOS, and Google's Android. Comscore estimates that approximately 50.5% of mobile phone owners in Canada have an Android smartphone, and 38.3% own and operate an iPhone running iOS. (see Appendix B, Table 2.1).

APPLICATION COMPARISON CRITERIA

An effort was made when comparing apps to include information that might be relevant to the development of a rural access to justice app. The main functions of applications are listed, as well as foreseeable use scenarios that illustrate the purpose and scope of the app. Various strengths and weaknesses of apps are also canvassed. If the app developer or associated organization indicated that data is gathered by the app this is also conveyed. Finally, apps were differentiated based on their complexity and assigned a rough of idea how complex the apps would have been to develop is conveyed by a low, medium, or high rating according to how difficult it may have been to develop the app. Low complexity apps will have

¹ Canadian Wireless Telecommunications Association, *Wireless Phone Subscribers in Canada: 2014* (2014) Facts and Figures, online: <http://cwta.ca/facts-figures/>; Langlois, Brett "With Growth Comes Change: The Evolving Canadian Mobile Landscape" (March 2015) Catalyst, online: http://catalyst.ca/2015-canadian- smartphone-market/>. ² Comscore, Digital Future in Focus Canada 2015: The 2014 Digital Year in Review & Predictions for the

Year Ahead (2015) Presentations and Whitepapers, online:

http://www.comscore.com/Insights/Presentations-and-Whitepapers/2015/2015-Canada-Digital-Future-in- Focus>.

³ Ibid.

taken less time and resources to build and maintain than medium complexity apps, and high complexity apps are likely to be close to the cutting edge of what is possible in application development today.⁴

COMPARABLE SMARTPHONE APPLICATIONS

	Name	Legal Aid NSW
	Platform	iOS, Android
	Created By	Legal Aid (New South Wales, Australia)
Functions	 Search for close View contact & I Travel estimate Watch videos at View a calendar View legal aid et Pay contribution Calculate your le View legal aid fa 	est legal aid center hours information for each center to each center from current location bout a range of common legal issues of legal aid workshops ligibility criteria towards the legal costs in your case egal aid eligibility actsheets and resources
Use Case	A person could w legal issue, check exactly how much legal aid clinic wa	atch a video and realize they are experiencing a k to see if they are eligible for legal aid, calculate in they were eligible for, find out where the nearest as, and how long it might take them to get there.
Strengths	Easy to use tile na scalable; easy to	avigation system (by category); feasible technology; update; good resource hub.
Limitations	Cannot search for communication be	r, or diagnose, legal issues; Does not directly host etween lawyers or clinics; unilingual.
Data Gathering	Does not appear	to collect or log user information.
Complexity	MEDIUM	

Name

Legal Dictionary & Guide

⁴ The complexity of computing logic is also taken into consideration here. Application, and all software for that matter, can range in the complexity of machine computing logic from (i) purely displaying information, to (ii) using conditional, if-then logic to take users down a decision tree path, to (iii) keyword searching and display, to (iv) understanding and interpreting natural language and responding appropriately. Even cutting edge tools developed by <u>Apple</u>, <u>Google</u>, and <u>Microsoft</u> struggle to manage this last area of machine logic, making this level of computing less than feasible for smaller developers. However, there is always news of progress in this field. In the legal world, University of Toronto's <u>Ross</u>, powered by IBM's <u>Watson</u>, represents the leading edge of responsive natural language computing. This technology has yet to be implemented in smartphone app form.

	Platform	iOS, Android
	Created By	The Law.com LLC (New York, New York)
Functions	 Access to ov Access to hu Allows users Links to law.o Links to law.o 	er 14,000 searchable legal concept definitions ndreds of "legal guides" and articles to ask legal questions in app com forum where users can ask legal question com lawyer directory to find a nearby lawyer
Use Case	A tenant has a pa uses the app to lo	rticular question about a term in her lease, she ok up 'easement' and finds out what it means.
Strengths	Dictionary availab	le offline; search feature is quick and easy to use.
Limitations	Covers U.S. law only; Unilingual; Dictionary works well and forms the core of the app, other services take place off-app and are not well executed (e.g. "ask a legal question" button brings you to an online forum where you may or may not have a question answered by a reputable lawyer, no time guarantees); very short definitions, no examples provided. Articles are not easily searchable.	
Data Gathering	The app itself doe	s not appear to log any user data.
Complexity	LOW (difficult to p	opulate dictionary however)

	Name	Avvo Advisor	
	Platform	iOS	
	Created By	Avvo (Seattle, Washington)	
Functions	 Allows use minutes w Collects particular Transfers 	ers to choose an area of law and talk to a lawyer for 15 ho specializes in that area for a fee (\$39) ayment prior to call payment to lawyer after call	
Use Case	A person has a business, they within minutes	A person has a few legal questions about setting up their small business, they open avvo, select the business tile, pay \$39 and within minutes are talking to a lawyer experienced in that area.	
Strengths	Lawyers availa whenever and solve small lega to use; relativel	ble on call within minutes of requesting legal advice, wherever people need the service; An easy way to al issues; does not rely on video conferencing; simple y low cost.	

Limitations	Available in the U.S. only; Available for iPhone users only; Limited to short phone calls and not ideal for complex legal problems; cost may still be prohibitive for many people.
Data Gathering	It is likely that Avvo collects data user topic requests.
Complexity	MEDIUM

	Name	iTriage
	Platform	iOS, Android
**	Created By	iTriage (Denver, Colorado)
Functions	 You can sear causes, and appropriate t Find any doc maps, contac Stores perso Access to en Appointment Information c drugs, and p Save your m doctor inform 	rch health-related symptoms, learn about potential then iTriage Health will help you find the most reatment option, nearby health facility or doctor stor in your area quickly and easily (U.S.), with ct information, and availability hours. anal health records nergency hotlines setting with doctors and other health providers on thousands of medical symptoms, treatment, rocedures edication plan, insurance, health plan advice and nation in one place
Use Case	A mother is conce child is showing. I iTriage to search doctor who is ava because the prob	erned about the irregular health symptoms that her Not sure how serious the problem is, she uses the symptoms and find the most likely cause, find a ilable and nearby, and plans to call her after work lem isn't too serious. <u>See video</u>
Strengths	Lots of useful information; well organized; very well reviewed; being able to self-diagnose is incredibly useful; provides a one-stop information storage place for all health care information; quick access to health hotlines is great for emergencies; helps reduce unnecessary ER visits; helps coordinate care; helps rural users find the right specialist and set up an appointment.	
Limitations	Designed for the l physician; user m may be misinform	U.S. market; Does not provide direct contact with a ay not be able to self-discover health problem, and ned; unilingual.
Data Gathering	User data and tre	nds are most likely captured by iTriage.
Complexity	HIGH	

Dr	Name	Doctor on Demand
	Platform	iOS, Android
	Created By	Doctor on Demand Inc. (San Francisco, California)
Functions	 Facilitates a l Make a video Book a walk- Doctors can l Visits cost \$4 	ive video visit with a doctor or psychologist call appointment; take a video call in appointment prescribe after visit 0
Use Case	A person living far away from the nearest population center can set up an appointment to talk to a psychologist about the panic attacks they have been experiencing lately.	
Strengths	Allows medication prescriptions (where appropriate); on-board video calling makes communication easier; efficient, timesaving tool for anyone who finds it difficult to visit a doctor or psychologist in person (the elderly, busy people, persons with a disability etc). <u>See video</u>	
Limitations	Only available in 15 U.S. states; requires video calling proficiency & relatively fast internet connection; requires users to be 17+; only some prescriptions are available.	
Data Gathering	Visits with physici	ans & psychologists are confidential.
Complexity	HIGH	

	Name	Sherpaa
	Platform	iOS
	Created By	Sherpaa (New York, New York)
Functions	 Users can instant message doctors in real time to ask a wide range of medical and psychological questions Users can view doctor information before asking a question App provides insurance information Doctors can act as referral hubs for user inquiries 	
Use Case	A person working a stressful office job gets a sharp and prolonged headache, he uses Sherpaa to ask a doctor if taking Advil will help and whether or not he should work through the headache or take the day off and visit a physician.	

Strengths	Doctors attempt to respond immediately if messages are sent between 8am and 8pm; App intentionally avoids video to make responses faster and make the service more approachable; Convenient for doctors; convenient for quick medical questions (doctors will also recommend further assessment or treatment if needed). <u>See video</u>
Limitations	Limited to number of doctors participating in the service; Limited to the U.S.A; Only available for iPhone users; designed for employers, requires employers to pay a monthly fee/employee.
Data Gathering	Sherpaa likely gathers data on user questions (timing, subject matter, length of "conversation" etc).
Complexity	MEDIUM

	Name	Community Health Centers
COMMUNITY HEALTH CENTERS	Platform	Android
Ŷ	Created By	Segue Technologies (Arlington, Virginia)
Functions	 Uses current show nearby Provides a m Provides info Provides the Disease Con news feed 	location metrics from gps enabled smartphone to community health centers hap and directions to community health centers ormation on each of the centers latest public health information from the Center for trol (CDC) & Department of Health with a direct
Use Case	A parent opens th vaccination progra nearest available and a phone num	ne news feed on the app and sees that a new flu am is in effect in their area, they search for the vaccination center and are given driving directions ber to call and book an appointment.
Strengths	Keeps users up to Provides dynamic	o date with the latest U.S. health care initiatives; c location information.
Limitations	Limited to Android; Limited to the U.S.; Providing in-app driving directions might be redundant, many people may prefer to use their phone's native map application; does not allow users to communicate directly with representatives from nearby health care centers (in-app). <i>App did not display map properly when tested</i> .	
Data Gathering	This app gathers record this data (p	location data, but it is unlikely that the app makers privacy concerns).
Complexity	LOW	

	Name	Quora
	Platform	iOS, Android
	Created By	Quora, Inc (Mountain View, California)
Functions	Search, ask,Vote on best	and answer questions question answers
Use Case	A group of friends he forced them to if this was legal, h and receives a nu	were caught trespassing on a neighbors property, leave at gunpoint; one of the friends wants to know e asks the Quora community by <u>posting a question</u> mber of helpful responses.
Strengths	Allows users to ge community resport and highly regard Yahoo answers);	et information about current topics of interest; Sifts nses through a voting system; more professional ed than other community question platforms (e.g. Has a number of professional contributors.
Limitations	Requires lengthy login and signup process; takes a long time to load content, even in fast wifi areas; requires users to log on with their real full name; questions may or may not be answered, and there is no guarantee that professional advice will be given; Legal professions are wary of providing advice.	
Data Gathering	Quora logs all que and profile inform	estions asked and answered by users; user signups ation are also logged.
Complexity	MEDIUM	

APPLICATIONS FOR BOTH SMART & FEATURE PHONES

FRONTLINESMS LEGAL	Name	Frontline SMS
	Platform	All phones (including feature & basic)
	Created By	Occam Technologies (Washington, DC)
Functions	 Software program that allows an organization to monitor and interact with individuals via text message (sms) Can connect to twitter Can be used to administrate polls and gather data Can be used to have text conversations Can be used to send out important alerts 	

Use Case	A person living in a rural location, without regular access to the internet wants to ask a legal question and get help with a family conflict. They know that they can get information by sending a text message to a certain number. Using FrontlineSMS software, the nearest family legal receives the text message and is able to respond in a timely and helpful manner. They conduct a short intake assessment and provide referral advice to the client.
Strengths	Free to use; able to contact and connect with any mobile phone user with access to text (sms) messaging; does not require an internet connection on the user's end to work; allows one organization to push information and have conversations with multiple users simultaneously; can be connected to twitter sms is monitored and responded to much faster than email or voicemail. <u>See this video</u> for further benefits.
Limitations	Requires interaction to be effective (human <-> human), and as such needs to be monitored; If overused, people may be annoyed (sms seen as a personal way to connect).
Data Gathering	Data collection is encouraged, polls can be distributed and results tabulated.
Complexity	LOW

APPENDIX A: CANADIAN SMARTPHONE OPERATING SYSTEM ADOPTION

TABLE 1.1

Comscore December 2014 $^{\scriptscriptstyle 5}$



⁵ Supra note 2, at 22.

APPENDIX B: SMARTPHONE VS. FEATURE PHONE OWNERSHIP

Smartphone: a cellular phone that performs many of the functions of a computer, typically having a touchscreen interface, Internet access, and an operating system capable of running downloaded applications.

Feature Phone: a mobile phone that incorporates features such as the ability to access the Internet and store and play music but lacks the advanced functionality of a smartphone.

TABLE 2.1

Comscore December 2014⁶

Smartphone Market Penetration by % of Mobile Subscribers



TABLE 2.2 Comscore December 2014⁷



⁷ Ibid, at 21.

APPENDIX C: NETWORK COVERAGE IN CANADA

TABLE 3.1Rogers (4g, LTE, 3g)⁸



TABLE 3.2 Bell (4g, LTE)⁹



 ⁸ Rogers, *Network Coverage* (2015), online: http://www.rogers.com/web/content/network-coverage/.
 ⁹ Bell, *Coverage Map* (2015), online: http://network.bell.ca/en/coverage/.

TABLE 3.3Telus 3g (4g map here.)



¹⁰ Telus, *Coverage Map* (2015), online: <http://www.telus.com/en/on/mobility/network/coverage-map.jsp>.

TABLE 3.4Canadian Population Distribution (2006)¹¹



¹¹ Natural Resources Canada, *Population Distribution* (2006) Population: Population Distribution, online: http://www.nrcan.gc.ca/earth-sciences/geography/atlas-canada/selected-thematic-maps/16880.